

#### NEW HAMPSHIRE INSURANCE DEPARTMENT

#### INFORMATIONAL PACKET ACCOMPANYING

## THE ANNUAL REPORT TO THE MEDICAL MALPRACTICE PANEL AND INSURANCE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE November 1, 2016

This report focuses on medical injury liability claim activity, providing frequency and severity information as well as resolution time frames from first report to the closing of the claim by the insurer. Most of the information was obtained from the reports submitted by insurers as required under Ins 3800 and RSA 519-B:16. The data shown on the exhibits reflects only claims reported starting in 2009. The data includes information submitted through the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of 2016. The report includes information on medical malpractice premium trends observed in New Hampshire as well as nationally.

#### Medical Injury Liability Claim Activity

Exhibits 1-9 provide data associated with claim activity as reported by insurers in accordance with Ins 3800. After Exhibit 10, please note that an Appendix has been provided. This Appendix provides general information about the data received, definitions and coding terminology, and formulas for the calculations included on the exhibits.

The department received 1370 closed claim reports between 2009 and the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter, 2016. When comparing years, remember that the most recent year contains only two quarters of claims data. Unless otherwise labeled, "year" is the year in which the claim was closed.

It's important to understand what constitutes a "claim". A person may file multiple claims in response to a medical injury; for example a claim may be made against multiple doctors, as well as against the hospital or facility where the injury occurred. For purposes of this report, each claim is counted separately, for example, a suit involving a hospital and 2 physicians would be counted as 3 claims since it involves 3 defendants. Most providers report claims in this manner. However, some providers report an occurrence involving multiple defendants as a single claim. This method of reporting claims introduces some distortion into the data: since the count of claims is lower, the average indemnity or expense dollars associated with each claim would appear higher for these providers.

"Indemnity Paid" means the amount paid to indemnify the claimant on behalf of the insured health care provider. Such amounts do not include expense dollars incurred by the insurer to handle the claim. Non-zero paid claims are just that – claims where indemnity of at least \$1 was paid to the claimant.

Claim expenses refer to the insurer or provider's cost to adjust and defend the claim. Other costs, such as the legal cost to the injured party, or the cost of the system to the State are not quantified. Expenses have been divided into two categories in accordance with the reporting requirements of Ins 3800. They are labeled as "Defense Counsel Expense" and Allocated Loss Adjustment Expense or "ALAE". In order to provide a framework by which expense dollars should have been assigned to one or the other, we can look at statistical reporting requirements for insurance companies. In insurance accounting terms, insurers under the general statistical reporting requirements established by the National Association of Insurance Commissioners (NAIC), categorize defense counsel expense as part of "defense and cost containment" (DCC) and ALAE as "adjusting and other" (AO). For your information:

DCC includes defense, litigation, and medical cost containment expense; it includes, but is not limited to:

- a. surveillance
- b. litigation management
- c. fees or salaries for appraisers, private investigators, hearing reps, fraud investigators
- d. attorney fees incurred owing a duty to defend, even if coverage does not exist
- e. cost of engaging experts

AO are those expenses not included in DCC and include, but are not limited to:

- a. fees and expenses of adjusters
- b. attorney fees incurred in the determination of coverage
- c. adjusters fees and salaries

1,370 closed claims collectively provide sufficient volume to draw credible conclusions. However, as the data is divided into smaller and smaller subsets for any part of the analysis, the conclusions reached should be viewed with some degree of caution.

#### Exhibit 1 - Indemnity Paid and Expenses Paid

#### 1A: Indemnity Paid

- Only 32% of the closed claims had an <u>indemnity</u> payment while 66% incurred <u>defense counsel</u> expenses.
- The chart below shows indemnity payments on claims with indemnity over \$1m. Data is shown by year. There was a claim of \$5.5 million closed in 2013, a claim of \$6.25 million closed in 2014, and a claim of \$4.75 million closed in 2015.

Year Closed	Claim Count	Total Indemnity on Large Claims
2009	0	\$0
2010	1	\$1,000,000
2011	2	\$2,000,000
2012	8	\$14,400,791
2013	12	\$20,550,000
2014	8	\$18,435,000
2015	5	\$9,459,995
2016	5	\$5,900,000
Grand Total	41	\$71,745,786

#### 1B: Expense Paid

Defense costs per claim closed through 2016 averaged \$22,000 per claim. Loss adjustment expenses
on these claims averaged an additional \$8,000 per claim. About half of the expense dollars are spent
on claims that close with no indemnity payment.

#### 1C: Ratios of Expense to Indemnity

Another way to examine expense costs is to look at the proportional relationship between expense \$ and indemnity \$ based on the total average cost of each claim (indemnity paid plus expense paid) and the proportional relationship between Defense Counsel and ALAE based on total expenses paid.

- The figures labeled "Distribution" shows the proportion of total \$ which are indemnity payments vs. all expense payments
- The figures labeled "Expense Distribution" shows how the total expense payments are divided between "defense counsel" and "ALAE"
- The figures labeled "Expenses as a % of Indemnity" relate expense dollars to indemnity dollars and is simply a different way of looking at the relationship between those two items

The various distributions are relatively consistent and appear to be decreasing over time. This is important because the relationship between indemnity and expense costs is ultimately a significant influence on the premium levels charged in NH. The decrease is exaggerated by the 3 very large claims in the most recent three years.

#### 1D – 1F: Size of Payments

These exhibits are provided to show how payments are distributed by the size of each claim. Payments are split into indemnity payment categories (\$100,000 increments).

#### Exhibit 2 – Indemnity Paid and Expenses Paid by Severity Code

Exhibit 2 is a set of charts similar to what is provided in Exhibit 1 but in finer detail based on Severity Codes. The list of severity codes is shown in the Appendix, and range from Emotional Only (01) to Death (09). These are the same codes used by the National Practitioner Data Bank Reporting system as "Outcome" codes.

Exhibits 2-A through 2-G show differences in average indemnity payments and expenses between claims of varying severity levels. The data in each category is relatively small so the reliability and consistency of the results is more uncertain. Even so, there is value in looking at relationships between severity categories; most relationships seem intuitive: indemnity increases as the severity of the claim rises, so do the cost of defending the claim, although less steeply.

Exhibit 2-G provides a summary chart where all the years have been combined from Exhibits 2-B through 2-F.

#### **Exhibit 3- Resolution Time Horizon**

Exhibits 3-A through 3-C show claim count distributions for "all closed claims", "closed claims with indemnity paid", and "closed claims with defense counsel expense paid" for the following time horizons relating to claim resolution:

- Injury Date to Date Reported (Exhibit 3-A)
- Date Reported to Date of Closure (Exhibit 3-B)
- Injury Date to Date of Closure (Exhibit 3-C)

Exhibits 3-D through 3-F show, for the same time horizons, average indemnity and expense paid amounts.

#### Exhibit 4 - Claim Activity Involving Screening Panels

For claims reported since 1/1/2009, the number of claims reported to us by providers as closed with panel proceedings in progress is 193. Of that number, 55 have had a hearing, and 138 were closed before the hearing. This compares to the data supplied by Chief Justice Nadeau by letter dated September 29, 2016, which says that 85 cases have been heard since Fiscal Year 2009.

The exhibits in this section examine the usefulness and effectiveness of the Screening Panel.

#### 4A: Screening Panel Usage and Costs

- 14% of claims reported and closed since 1/1/2009 have used the screening panel. The percentage of claims using the screening panel process on a reported basis has generally declined over the years.

#### 4B: Screening Panel Time from Claim Report to Closure

- About 14% of claims involving the screening panel closed during the first year, versus 19% of claims where the panel was waived or not initiated. By the end of the second year, 43% of claims involving the screening panel had closed, versus a 55% of claims that did not initiate the panel process.
- On average, a claim took 27 months to close when the screening panel was used, vs. 24 months when
  it was not used. For claims with indemnity payments, an average claim took 29 months to close
  whether the screening panel was used or not.

#### 4C: Screening Panel Usage by Injury Severity

- 63% of claims using the screening panel were in the Permanent, Serious and Fatal categories versus only 52% of claims for which the panel was waived or not initiated.
- 37% of claims using the screening panel were identified as Emotional only, Temporary or Minor compared to 48% of claims for which the panel was waived or not initiated.

#### 4D: Screening Panel Usage for Permanent, Serious, and Fatal Claims

- For claims identified as having a lawsuit filed, 4% went to trial when the screening panel was used vs. 9% when the screening panel was bypassed.
- Average Indemnity Payments were 22% lower when the screening panel was used.
- Overall claim expenses were 1% higher when the screening panel was used.
- In total, the cost of a claim was 18% lower when the screening panel was used.

#### 4E: Screening Panel Usage for Temporary and Minor Claims

- For claims identified as having a lawsuit filed, 7% went to trial when the screening panel was used vs. 8% when the screening panel was bypassed.
- Average Indemnity Payments were 39% lower when the screening panel was used.
- Overall claim expenses were 21% higher when the screening panel was used.
- In total, the cost of a claim was 18% lower when the screening panel was used.

#### Exhibits 5 through 7 - Location of Injury, Medical Profession, Malpractice Provider

- We have provided distributions of claim counts and average indemnity, defense counsel and other claim expense payments for claims reported and settled since 1/1/2009.
  - o Exhibit 5 provides claim information by where the injury occurred. The average Indemnity and associated Expenses by location are also shown on this exhibit.
  - Exhibit 6 provides information about the profession of the defendant in malpractice cases.
     Average Indemnity and associated Expenses by Profession are also shown on this exhibit.
  - Exhibit 7 provides distributions of reported counts and closed counts for all entities reporting under Ins 3800 to the Department. The largest provider of Medical Malpractice insurance in New Hampshire is ProSelect. Dartmouth Hitchcock, second on the list of claims reported, is a self-insurer.

#### Exhibits 8 and 9 - Medical Malpractice Insurance Premiums

Exhibit 8 shows the most recent price comparison for the leading regulated insurance carriers, Medical Mutual of Maine, ProSelect, and Medical Protective Company. There continues to be some variability among the carriers.

Exhibit 9 shows the frequency and level of rate revisions for Physicians and Surgeons Medical Malpractice insurance since 2009. Rate changes have differed among the companies during this period. The level of activity has decreased over time with only one change among all three insurers in the last 3 years.

#### Conclusion

The information presented here is designed to provide the committee and other interested parties with a compilation of data related to the use of screening panels in New Hampshire, and an identification of any impacts from that process on medical malpractice insurance premiums charged to healthcare providers by insurers. The collection of this data was authorized under provisions of RSA 519-B and Ins 3800.

Prepared by:

Sally MacFadden, ACAS, MAAA Property & Casualty Actuary

New Hampshire Insurance Department

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009-7/1/2016

#### Table of Exhibits

Exhibit 1	Indemnity Paid by year and by Size of Settlement
1-A	Counts, Indemnity Paid, Average Costs
1-B	Expense Paid, Average Expenses
1-C	Expense Ratios
1-D	Indemnity Paid by Size of Settlement
1-E	Defense Expense Paid by Size of Settlement
1-F	ALAE Paid by Size of Settlement
Exhibit 2	Indemnity Paid by Severity of Injury
2-A	Counts, Average Indemnity and Expense by Severity
2-B	Counts and Average Indemnity by Severity Group
2-C	Defense Costs by Severity Group
2-D	ALAE by Severity Group
2-E	Expense Ratios by Severity Group - All Closed Claims
2-F	Expense Ratios by Severity Group - Claims with Indemnity
2-G	Summary by Severity Group
Exhibit 3	Time Horizon
3-A	Time Horizon: Injury to Report
3-B	Time Horizon: Report to Closure
3-C	Time Horizon: Injury to Closure
3-D	Average Indemnity and Expense by Time Horizon: Injury to Report
3-E	Average Indemnity and Expense by Time Horizon: Report to Closure
3-F	Average Indemnity and Expense by Time Horizon: Injury to Closure
Exhibit 4	Screening Panel Usage and Costs
4-A	Counts, Number Tried, Average Costs
4-B	Screening Panel Time Horizon: Report to Closure
4-C	Screening Panel Usage by Severity of Injury
4-D	Permanent, Serious, and Fatal: Number Tried, Average Costs, Time Horizon
4-E	Emotional, Temporary, and Minor: Number Tried, Average Costs, Time Horizon
Exhibit 5	Counts and Average Costs by Location of Injury
Exhibit 6	Counts and Average Costs by Provider Profession
Exhibit 7	Claims by Company
Exhibit 8	Medical Malpractice Rate Comparison
Exhibit 9	Medical Malpractice Rate Change History

#### Exhibit 1-A Closed Claim Summary Indemnity Paid

Closed Claims								
Year Closed	Total Number of Closed Claims	Number of Claims with No Indemnity Paid	Number of Claims with Indemnity Paid	Number of Claims without Defense Counsel Expenses	Number of Claims with Defense Counsel Expenses			
2009	27	22	5	14	13			
2010	108	91	17	53	55			
2011	175	115	60	51	124			
2012	261	179	82	93	168			
2013	252	154	98	73	179			
2014	189	124	65	45	144			
2015	209	124	85	59	150			
2016	149	117	32	84	65			
Total Closed	1370	926	444	472	898			
Percent of Total		68%	32%	34%	66%			

Maria Para de la color	Closed Claims								
Year Closed	Total Indemnity Paid	Average Indemnity For All Closed Claims	Average Indemnity For Claims with Indemnity Paid	Average Indemnity for Claims with Defense Counsel Expense					
2009	\$26,554	\$983	\$5,311	\$0					
2010	\$3,543,615	\$32,811	\$208,448	\$60,564					
2011	\$13,429,562	\$76,740	\$223,826	\$106,577					
2012	\$27,764,978	\$106,379	\$338,597	\$157,140					
2013	\$37,830,266	\$150,120	\$386,023	\$182.864					
2014	\$29,539,050	\$156,291	\$454,447	\$200,108					
2015	\$27,525,392	\$131,700	\$323,828	\$178,431					
2016	\$16,516,463	\$110,849	\$516,139	\$235.718					
Total Closed	\$156,175,880	\$113,997	\$351,747	\$163,230					
6 Year Tend		7.5%	12.8%	13.5%					
5 Year Tend		-0.5%	6.9%	8.2%					

Average Indemnity = (Indemnity Paid) / (Number of Claims)

#### Exhibit 1-B Closed Claim Summary Expenses Paid

A STATE OF THE STATE OF	All Closed Claims							
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Defense Counsel Expense	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Total ALAE	Average ALAE			
2009	27	\$53,060	\$1,965	\$6,661	\$247			
2010	108	\$736,836	\$6,823	\$204,537	\$1,894			
2011	175	\$3,156,728	\$18,038	\$998,964	\$5,697			
2012	261	\$4,658,112	\$17,847	\$2,631,326	\$10,082			
2013	252	\$7,520,275	\$29.842	\$3,025,263	\$12,005			
2014	189	\$4,663,449	\$24,674	\$1,367,062	\$7,233			
2015	209	\$6,125,060	\$29,307	\$1,400,670	\$6,702			
2016	149	\$2,767,455	\$18,574	\$1,768,386	\$11.868			
Total Closed	1370	\$29,680,977	\$21,665	\$11,400,870	\$8,322			
6 Year Tend			4.2%	,	5.7%			
5 Year Tend			0.6%		-2.5%			

Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid								
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Defense Counsel Expense	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Total ALAE	Average ALAE			
2009	5	\$0	\$0	\$2,657	\$531			
2010	17	\$207,256	\$12,192	\$84,945	\$4,997			
2011	60	\$1,758,243	\$29,304	\$624,897	\$10,415			
2012	82	\$2,379,603	\$29,020	\$1,998,830	\$24,376			
2013	98	\$3,857,134	\$39,359	\$1,412,631	\$14,415			
2014	65	\$2,531,863	\$38.952	\$688,313	\$10,589			
2015	85	\$3,547,338	\$41,733	\$808,483	\$9.512			
2016	32	\$1,604,577	\$50,143	\$458,150	\$14,317			
Total Closed	444	\$15,886,014	\$35,779	\$6,078,906	\$13,691			

Closed Claims No Indemnity Paid								
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Defense Counsel Expense	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Total ALAE	Average ALA			
2009	22	\$53,060	\$2,412	\$4,005	\$182			
2010	91	\$529,580	\$5,820	\$119,592	\$1,314			
2011	115	\$1,398,485	\$12,161	\$372,066	\$3,235			
2012	179	\$2,278,509	\$12,729	\$632,495	\$3,533			
2013	154	\$3,663,141	\$23,787	\$1,612,632	\$10,472			
2014	124	\$2,131,586	\$17,190	\$678,750	\$5,474			
2015	124	\$2.577,722	\$20,788	\$592,187	\$4,776			
2016	117	\$1,162,878	\$9.939	\$1,310,236	\$11,199			
Total Closed	926	\$13,794,963	\$14,897	\$5,321,964	\$5,747			

Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expenses								
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Defense Counsel Expense	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Total ALAE	Average ALAI			
2009	13	\$53,060	\$4,082	\$1,775	\$137			
2010	55	\$736,836	\$13,397	\$182,474	\$3,318			
2011	124	\$3,156,728	\$25,457	\$964,199	\$7,776			
2012	168	\$4,658,112	\$27,727	\$2,576,269	\$15,335			
2013	179	\$7,520,275	\$42,013	\$2,872,952	\$16,050			
2014	144	\$4,663,449	\$32,385	\$1,357,436	\$9,427			
2015	150	\$6,125,060	\$40,834	\$1,372,788	\$9,152			
2016	65	\$2,767,455	\$42.576	\$720,491	\$11.084			
Total Closed	898	\$29,680,977	\$33.052	\$10,048,384	\$11,190			

Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense) / (# of Closed Claims) Average ALAE = (Total ALAE) / (# of Closed Claims)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

#### Exhibit 1-C Closed Claim Summary Ratios

All Closed Claims								
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense D	istribution	Expenses as a % of		
Test Closed	# of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense	ALAE	Indemnity		
2009	27	30.8%	69.2%	61.5%	7.7%	224.9%		
2010	108	79.0%	21.0%	16.4%	4.6%	26.6%		
2011	175	76.4%	23.6%	18.0%	5.7%	30.9%		
2012	261	79.2%	20.8%	13.3%	7.5%	26.3%		
2013	252	78.2%	21.8%	15.5%	6.3%	27.9%		
2014	189	83.0%	17.0%	13.1%	3.8%	20.4%		
2015	209	78.5%	21.5%	17.5%	4.0%	27.3%		
2016	149	78.5%	21.5%	13.1%	8.4%	27.5%		
Total Closed	1370	79.2%	20.8%	15.0%	5.8%	26.3%		

10 S	Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid								
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense D	Istribution	Expenses as a % of			
Teal Closed	# of Closed Claums	Indemnity	Expense	Defense	ALAE	Indemnity			
2009	5	90.9%	9.1%	0.0%	9.1%	10.0%			
2010	17	92 4%	7.6%	5.4%	2.2%	8.2%			
2011	60	84.9%	15.1%	11.1%	4.0%	17.7%			
2012	82	86.4%	13.6%	7.4%	6.2%	15.8%			
2013	98	87.8%	12.2%	8.9%	3.3%	13.9%			
2014	65	90.2%	9.8%	7.7%	2.1%	10.9%			
2015	85	86.3%	13.7%	11.1%	2.5%	15.8%			
2016	32	88.9%	11.1%	8.6%	2.5%	12.5%			
Total Closed	444	87.7%	12.3%	8.9%	3.4%	14.1%			

Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distril	oution	Expense D	istribution	Expenses as a % of
rear Glosed	- IF OI Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense	ALAE	Indemnity
2009	13	0.0%	100.0%	96.8%	3.2%	#DIV/0!
2010	55	78.4%	21.6%	17.3%	4.3%	27.6%
2011	124	76.2%	23.8%	18.2%	5.6%	31.2%
2012	168	78.5%	21.5%	13.8%	7.7%	27.4%
2013	179	75.9%	24.1%	17.4%	6.7%	31.8%
2014	144	82.7%	17.3%	13.4%	3.9%	20.9%
2015	150	78.1%	21.9%	17.9%	4.0%	28.0%
2016	65	81.5%	18.5%	14.7%	3.8%	22.8%
Total Closed	898	78.7%	21.3%	15.9%	5.4%	27.1%

Indemnity Distribution=(Indemnity Paid) / (Indemnity Paid +Defense Counsel Expense+ALAE)

Expense Distribution=(Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE) / (Indemnity Paid + Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE)

Defense Counsel Distribution=(Defense Counsel Expense) / (Indemnity Paid + Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE)
ALAE Distribution=(ALAE) / (Indemnity Paid + Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE)

Expenses as a % of Indemnity=(Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE) / (Indemnity Paid)

Exhibit 1-D Closed Claim Summary Size of Indemnity Payments

	All Closed Claims								
indemnity Payment	# of Claims with Indemnity Payments	% of Claims with Indemnity Payments	Total Indemnity Paid	Average Indemnity	% of Total Indemnity Payments				
\$1-\$100,000	211	47.5%	\$7,408,545	\$35,112	4.7%				
\$100,001-\$200,000	56	12.6%	\$8,408,942	\$150,160	5.4%				
\$200,001-\$300,000	33	7.4%	\$8,245,959	\$249,878	5.3%				
\$300,001-\$400,000	26	5.9%	\$9,539,069	\$366,887	6.1%				
\$400,001-\$500,000	28	6.3%	\$12,931,166	\$461,827	8.3%				
\$500,001-\$600,000	11	2.5%	\$6,275,459	\$570,496	4.0%				
\$600,001-\$700,000	16	3.6%	\$10,800,000	\$675,000	6.9%				
\$700,001-\$800,000	14	3.2%	\$10,646,814	\$760,487	6.8%				
\$800,001-\$900,000	5	1.1%	\$4,299,139	\$859.828	2.8%				
\$900,001-\$1,000,000	20	4.5%	\$19,875,000	\$993,750	12.7%				
Over \$1,000.000	24	5.4%	\$57,745,786	\$2,406,074	37.0%				
Total Closed	444	100.0%	\$156,175,880	\$351,747	100.0%				

<sup>%</sup> of Claims with Indemnity Payments = (# of Claims with Indemnity Payments in Range) / (Total # of Claims with Indemnity Payments) Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid In Range) / (# of Claims with Indemnity Payments in Range)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

Exhibit 1-E
Closed Claim Summary
Size of Indemnity Payments with Defense Counsel Expenses

		Closed Claims	with Defense Couns	el Expenses		
Indemnity Payment	# of Claims with Indemnity Payments	# of Claims with Defense Counsel	Total Defense Counsel Expense	Average Defense Counsel Expense	% of Total Defense Counsel Expense	Defense Counsel Expense as a % of Indemnity Paid
\$0	0	557	\$13,794,963	\$24,767	46.5%	na
\$1-\$100,000	211	124	\$3,492,271	\$28,163	11.8%	47.1%
\$100,001-\$200,000	56	48	\$2,362,835	\$49,226	8.0%	28.1%
\$200,001-\$300,000	33	31	\$1,314,791	\$42,413	4.4%	15.9%
\$300,001-\$400,000	26	25	\$1,203,640	\$48,146	4.1%	12.6%
\$400,001-\$500,000	28	27	\$1,386,726	\$51,360	4.7%	10.7%
\$500,001-\$600,000	11	10	\$694,649	\$69,465	2.3%	11.1%
\$600,001-\$700,000	16	16	\$756,511	\$47,282	2.5%	7.0%
\$700,001-\$800,000	14	14	\$838,176	\$59,870	2.8%	7.9%
\$800,001-\$900,000	5	5	\$335,565	\$67,113	1.1%	7.8%
\$900,001-\$1,000,000	20	19	\$1,099,647	\$57,876	3.7%	5.5%
Over \$1,000,000	24	22	\$2,401,201	\$109,146	8.1%	4.2%
Total Closed	444	898	\$29,680,977	\$33,052	100.0%	19.0%

Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense In Range) / (# of Claims with Defense Counsel in Range) % of Total Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense in Range) / (Total Defense Counsel Expense)

Defense Counsel Expense as a % of Indemnity = (Total Defense Counsel Expense in Range) / (Total Indemnity Paid in Range)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

Exhibit 1-F Closed Claim Summary Size of Indemnity Payments with ALAE

		Close	d Claims with ALA		Document to the Avitor	
Indemnity Payment	# of Claims with Indemnity Payments	# of Claims with ALAE	Total ALAE	Average ALAE	% of Total ALAE	ALAE as a % of Indemnity Paid
\$0	0	531	\$5,321,964	\$10,023	46.7%	па
\$1-\$100,000	211	103	\$993,727	\$9,648	8.7%	13.4%
\$100,001-\$200,000	56	47	\$741,109	\$15,768	6.5%	8.8%
\$200,001-\$300,000	- 33	29	\$434,204	\$14,973	3.8%	5.3%
\$300,001-\$400,000	26	22	\$432,770	\$19,671	3.8%	4.5%
\$400,001-\$500,000	28	23	\$646,265	\$28,098	5.7%	5.0%
\$500,001-\$600,000	11	9	\$143,762	\$15,974	1.3%	2.3%
\$600,001-\$700,000	16	14	\$362,417	\$25,887	3.2%	3.4%
\$700,001-\$800,000	14	13	\$279,849	\$21,527	2.5%	2.6%
\$800,001-\$900,000	5	4	\$75,658	\$18,914	0.7%	1.8%
\$900,001-\$1,000,000	20	15	\$1,342,967	\$89,531	11.8%	6.8%
Over \$1,000,000	24	17	\$626,178	\$36,834	5.5%	1.1%
Total Closed	444	827	\$11,400,870	\$13,786	100.0%	7.3%

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE in Range) / (# of Claims with ALAE in Range)

% of Total ALAE = (Total ALAE in Range) / (Total ALAE)

ALAE as a % of Indemnity = (ALAE in Range) / (Total Indemnity Paid in Range)

Exhibit 2-A Closed Claim Summary Severity 01 - 09

			Ali Closed Claims			
Severity of Injury	Count of Indemnity Payments	Percent of Severity Claims	Average Length of Claim (Months)	Average Indemnity	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE
01	101	7.4%	13.9	\$7,761	\$11,630	\$1,677
02	76	5.5%	14.4	\$5,615	\$7,401	\$1,440
03	350	25.5%	16,2	\$19,725	\$7,660	\$2,982
04	165	12.0%	19.3	\$58,626	\$20,209	\$7,667
05	130	9.5%	20.1	\$83,129	\$17,988	\$14,547
06	135	9.9%	24.4	\$127,975	\$32,657	\$12,824
07	99	7.2%	28.8	\$389,387	\$50,940	\$21,008
08	30	2.2%	34.7	\$854,360	\$53,504	\$9,238
09	266	19.4%	26.2	\$173,302	\$31,996	\$10,646
No Code Provided	18	1.3%	9.0	\$1,484	\$1,241	\$128
Total Closed	1370	100.0%	20.6	\$113,997	\$21,665	\$8,322

CAMP CARE		Closed C	laims with Indemnit	y Paid		M
Severity of Injury	Count of Indemnity Payments	Percent of Severity Claims	Average Length of Claim (Months)	Average Indemnity	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE
01	20	4.5%	16.1	\$39,191	\$25,564	\$2,272
02	15	3.4%	15.2	\$28,451	\$16,874	\$398
03	111	25.0%	17.6	\$62,195	\$9,385	\$4,195
04	50	11.3%	24.8	\$193,464	\$29,225	\$10,330
05	34	7.7%	25.3	\$317,844	\$37,570	\$40,174
06	46	10.4%	24.7	\$375,577	\$44,845	\$17,685
07	47	10.6%	30.4	\$820,198	\$64,206	\$27.867
08	18	4.1%	33.4	\$1,423,934	\$73,768	\$9.855
09	100	22.5%	27.9	\$460,983	\$49,329	\$13,788
No Code Provided		0.7%	10.3	\$8.905	\$0	\$0
Total Closed	444	100.0%	23.9	\$351,747	\$66,849	\$25,678

III. CORPORED VIII.		Closed Claims wi	ith Defense Counsel	Expense Paid		
Severity of Injury	Count of Indemnity Payments	Percent of Severity Claims	Average Length of Claim (Months)	Average Indemnity	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE
01	59	6.6%	15.4	\$12,169	\$19,910	\$2,272
02	31	3.5%	19.8	\$11,661	\$18,145	\$1,390
03	160	17.8%	20.3	\$31,294	\$16,756	\$4,866
04	116	12.9%	21.9	\$82,041	\$28,745	\$10,746
05	90	10.0%	21.7	\$112,472	\$25,982	\$17,393
06	111	12.4%	25.1	\$155.059	\$39,718	\$13,495
07	88	9.8%	30.0	\$426,697	\$57,308	\$21,587
08	21	2.3%	28.3	\$1,030,039	\$76,434	\$13.194
09	215	23.9%	27.4	\$206,806	\$39,585	\$12,121
No Code Provided	7	0.8%	10.4	\$0	\$3,192	\$4
Total Closed	898	100.0%	23.7	\$163,230	\$33,052	\$11,190

Percent of Severity Claims = (Number of Severity Claims for Severity Code)/(Total Number of Claims) Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)

Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Exhibit 2-B Closed Claim Summary Indemnity Payments by Severity Grouping

		All Closed Claim	5	Claims with Indemnity Paid			
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	
2009	17	\$24,754	\$1,456	4	\$24,754	\$6,189	
2010	55	\$204,400	\$3,716	8	\$204,400	\$25,550	
2011	75	\$786,782	\$10,490	21	\$786,782	\$37,466	
2012	108	\$2,531,814	\$23,443	37	\$2,531,814	\$68,427	
2013	65	\$693,536	\$10,670	18	\$693,536	\$38,530	
2014	53	\$1,003,335	\$18,931	17	\$1,003,335	\$59,020	
2015	73	\$1,008,171	\$13,811	28	\$1,008,171	\$36,006	
2016	81_	\$1,861,463	\$22.981	13	\$1,861,463	\$143,189	
Total Closed	527	\$8,114,255	\$15,397	146	\$8,114,255	\$55,577	

		All Closed Claim	S	Clair	ns with Indemnity	y Paid
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity
2009	5	\$1,800	\$360	1	\$1,800	\$1,800
2010	27	\$525,000	\$19,444	3	\$525,000	\$175,000
2011	43	\$2,087,779	\$48,553	13	\$2,087,779	\$160,598
2012	55	\$6,137,384	\$111,589	13	\$6,137,384	\$472,106
2013	62	\$4,409,852	\$71,127	21	\$4,409,852	\$209,993
2014	39	\$1,218,548	\$31,245	10	\$1,218,548	\$121,855
2015	41	\$2,984,561	\$72,794	16	\$2,984,561	\$186,535
2016	23	\$3,115,000	\$135,435	7	\$3,115,000	\$445,000
Total Closed	295	\$20,479,924	\$69,423	84	\$20,479,924	\$243,809

		All Closed Claim	5	Claims with Indemnity Paid		
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity
2009	3	\$0	\$0	0	\$0	\$0
2010	12	\$1,650,000	\$137,500	3	\$1,650,000	\$550,000
2011	18	\$2,010,000	\$111,667	6	\$2,010,000	\$335,000
2012	40	\$6,685,000	\$167,125	12	\$6,685,000	\$557,083
2013	72	\$22,637,378	\$314,408	34	\$22,637,378	\$665,805
2014	53	\$20,904,667	\$394,428	26	\$20,904,667	\$804,026
2015	40	\$16,854,661	\$421,367	21	\$16,854,661	\$802,603
2016	26	\$10,715,000	\$412,115	9	\$10,715,000	\$1,190,556
Total Closed	264	\$81,456,706	\$308,548	111	\$81,456,706	\$733,844

		All Closed Claim:	5	Claims with Indemnity Paid			
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	
2009	1	\$0	\$0	0	\$0	\$0	
2010	12	\$1,150,000	\$95,833	2	\$1,150,000	\$575,000	
2011	36	\$8,545,000	\$237,361	20	\$8,545,000	\$427,250	
2012	53	\$12,400,780	\$233,977	19	\$12,400,780	\$652,673	
2013	50	\$10,089,500	\$201,790	25	\$10,089,500	\$403,580	
2014	40	\$6,410,000	\$160,250	11	\$6,410,000	\$582,727	
2015	. 55	\$6,677,999	\$121,418	20	\$6,677,999	\$333,900	
2016	19	\$825,000	\$43,421	3	\$825,000	\$275,000	
Total Closed	266	\$46,098,279	\$173,302	100	\$46.098.279	\$460,983	

Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)

Exhibit 2-C Closed Claim Summary
Defense Counsel Expenses by Severity Grouping

	All Closed Claims		Claims with Ir	ndemnity Paid	Claims with No Indemnity Paid	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense
2009	17	\$1,359	4	\$0	13	\$1,777
2010	55	\$3,921	8	\$41	47	\$4,582
2011	75	\$5,393	21	\$6,088	54	\$5,123
2012	108	\$8,463	37	\$11,880	71	\$6,682
2013	65	\$11,962	18	\$13,191	47	\$11,492
2014	53	\$15,519	17	\$27,455	36	\$9,882
2015	73	\$8,631	28	\$9,162	45	\$8,301
2016	81	\$7,786	13	\$21,360	68	\$5,191
Total Closed	527	\$8,383	146	\$12,371	381	\$6,855

	All Closed Claims		Claims with Indemnity Paid		Claims with No Indemnity Paid	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense
2009	5	\$4,166	1	\$0	4	\$5,207
2010	27	\$9,993	3	\$25,607	24	\$8,041
2011	43	\$17,147	13	\$29,078	30	\$11,977
2012	55	\$15,101	13	\$21,954	42	\$12,979
2013	62	\$19,752	21	\$22,145	41	\$18,526
2014	39	\$16,406	10	\$16,554	29	\$16,356
2015	41	\$23,985	16	\$42,258	25	\$12,290
2016	23	\$42,022	7	\$98,809	16	\$17,178
Total Closed	295	\$19,230	84	\$32,602	211	\$13,906

	All Closed Claims		Claims with Ir	ndemnity Paid	Claims with No Indemnity Paid	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense
2009	3	\$3,042	0	\$0	3	\$3,042
2010	12	\$11,060	3	\$32,581	9	\$3,886
2011	18	\$33,345	6	\$28,551	12	\$35,742
2012	40	\$41,038	12	\$69,676	28	\$28,764
2013	72	\$43,737	34	\$47,488	38	\$40,380
2014	53	\$35,640	26	\$52,226	27	\$19,669
2015	40	\$69,734	21	\$87,477	19	\$50,123
2016	26	\$32,540	9	\$54,858	17	\$20,725
Total Closed	264	\$41,882	111	\$57,733	153	\$30,383

Closed Claims with Severity 09									
	All Close	All Closed Claims		Claims with Indemnity Paid		Indemnity Paid			
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense Counsel Expense			
2009	1	\$0	0	\$0	1	\$0			
2010	12	\$9,888	2	\$16,183	10	\$8,629			
2011	36	\$39,297	20	\$54,054	16	\$20,851			
2012	53	\$23,799	19	\$43,080	34	\$13,023			
2013	50	\$47,183	25	\$61,602	25	\$32,763			
2014	40	\$32,763	11	\$49,247	29	\$26,511			
2015	55.	\$31,314	20	\$38,884	35	\$26,988			
2016	19	\$17,065	3	\$47,171	16	\$11,420			
Total Closed	266	\$31,996	100	\$49,329	166	\$21,553			

Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Exhibit 2-D Closed Claim Summary ALAE by Severity Grouping

Market milks			Claims with Severity 0				
V	All Closed	l Claims	Claims with In-	Claims with Indemnity Paid		Claims with No Indemnity Paid	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAI	
2009	17	\$159	4	\$589	13	\$27	
2010	55	\$488	8	\$438	47	\$496	
2011	75	\$1,767	21	\$2,472	54	\$1,493	
2012	108	\$1,956	37	\$4,638	71	\$558	
2013	65	\$6,033	18	\$4,467	47	\$6,633	
2014	53	\$1,978	17	\$3,170	36	\$1,415	
2015	73	\$1,989	28	\$2,783	45	\$1,496	
2016	81	\$3,792	13	\$5,800	68	\$3,408	
Total Closed	527	\$2,510	146	\$3,541	381	\$2,114	

V 011	All Closed	l Claims	Claims with Indemnity Paid		Claims with No Indemnity Paid	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE
2009	5	\$388	11_	\$300	4	\$410
2010	27	\$2,503	3	\$2,643	24	\$2,486
2011	43	\$4,745	13	\$11,256	30	\$1,924
2012	55	\$22,424	13	\$86,256	42	\$2,666
2013	62	\$10,909	21	\$16,028	41	\$8,288
2014	39	\$8,888	10	\$3,388	29	\$10,784
2015	41	\$4,527	16	\$9,108	25	\$1,595
2016	23	\$19,160	7	\$12,909	16	\$21.895
Total Closed	295	\$10,699	84	\$22,410	211	\$6,036

	All Classes		Claims with Severity 0			
Year Closed	All Closed	Claims	Claims with in	Claims with Indemnity Paid		Indemnity Paid
rear Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALA
2009	3	\$13	0	\$0	3	\$13
2010	12	\$5,856	3	\$21,110	9	\$771
2011	18	\$12,954	6	\$14,093	12	\$12,385
2012	40	\$14,831	12	\$30,351	28	\$8,179
2013	72	\$17,338	34	\$20,231	38	\$14,748
2014	53	\$12,072	26	\$20,150	27	\$4,292
2015	40	\$14,400	21	\$15,899	19	\$12,744
2016	26	\$27,973	9	\$26,986	17	\$28,496
Total Closed	264	\$15,485	111	\$20,726	153	\$11,683

Closed Claims with Severity 09									
V	All Closed	All Closed Claims		Claims with Indemnity Paid		Claims with No Indemnity Pald			
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALA			
2009	1	\$0	0	\$0	1 1	\$0			
2010	12	\$3,322	2	\$5,092	10	\$2,968			
2011	36	\$11,868	20	\$17,105	16	\$5,321			
2012	53	\$11,200	19	\$17,983	34	\$7,410			
2013	50	\$14,163	25	\$12,311	25	\$16,015			
2014	40	\$6,895	11	\$6,966	29	\$6.867			
2015	55	. \$8,979	20	\$12,547	35	\$6,939			
2016	19	\$15,436	3	\$16,504	16	\$15,236			
Total Closed	266	\$10,646	100	\$13,788	166	\$8,753			

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009-6/30/2016

Exhibit 2-E Closed Claim Summary Indemnity Payments For All Closed Claims by Severity Grouping

Closed Claims - Severity 01-03									
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense Dist	Expense Distribution				
Teal Closed	# Of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity			
2009	17	49.0%	51.0%	45.7%	5.3%	104.3%			
2010	55	45.7%	54.3%	48.3%	6.0%	118.6%			
2011	75	59.4%	40.6%	30.6%	10.0%	68.3%			
2012	108	69.2%	30.8%	25.0%	5.8%	44.4%			
2013	65	37.2%	62.8%	41.7%	21.0%	168.7%			
2014	53	52.0%	48.0%	42.6%	5.4%	92.4%			
2015	73	56.5%	43.5%	35.3%	8.1%	76.9%			
2016	81	66.5%	33.5%	22.5%	11.0%	50.4%			
Total Closed	527	58.6%	41.4%	31.9%	9.5%	70.7%			

Closed Claims - Severity 04-05									
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distril	bution	Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of			
real Closed	# Of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity			
2009	5	7.3%	92.7%	84.8%	7.9%	1264.9%			
2010	27	60.9%	39.1%	31.3%	7.8%	64.3%			
2011	43	68.9%	31.1%	24.3%	6.7%	45.1%			
2012	55	74.8%	25.2%	10.1%	15.0%	33.6%			
2013	62	69.9%	30.1%	19.4%	10.7%	43.1%			
2014	39	55.3%	44.7%	29.0%	15.7%	81.0%			
2015	41	71.9%	28.1%	23.7%	4.5%	39.2%			
2016	23	68.9%	31.1%	21.4%	9.7%	45.2%			
Total Closed	295	69.9%	30.1%	19.4%	10.8%	43.1%			

Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of	
Teal Closed	# Of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity	
2009	3	0.0%	100.0%	99.6%	0.4%	0.0%	
2010	12	89.0%	11.0%	7.2%	3.8%	12.3%	
2011	18	70.7%	29.3%	21.1%	8.2%	41,5%	
2012	40	74.9%	25.1%	18.4%	6.7%	33.4%	
2013	72	83.7%	16.3%	11.6%	4.6%	19.4%	
2014	53	89.2%	10.8%	8.1%	2.7%	12.1%	
2015	40	83.4%	16.6%	13.8%	2.8%	20.0%	
2016	26	87.2%	12.8%	6.9%	5.9%	14.7%	
Total Closed	264	B4.3%	15.7%	11.4%	4.2%	18.6%	

			d Claims - Severit	Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of	
Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity	
2009	1	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	
2010	12	87.9%	12.1%	9.1%	3.0%	13.8%	
2011	36	82.3%	17.7%	13.6%	4.1%	21.6%	
2012	53	87.0%	13.0%	8.8%	4.2%	15.0%	
2013	50	76.7%	23.3%	17.9%	5.4%	30.4%	
2014	40	80.2%	19.8%	16.4%	3.4%	24.7%	
2015	55	75.1%	24.9%	19.4%	5.6%	33.2%	
2016	19	57.2%	42.8%	22.5%	20.3%	74.8%	
Total Closed	266	80.3%	19.7%	14.8%	4.9%	24.6%	

Indemnity Distribution=(Avg Indemnity Paid)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expense Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Defense Counsel Distribution Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

ALAE Distribution=(Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expenses as a % of Indemnity=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009-6/30/2016

Exhibit 2-F Closed Claim Summary Closed Claims with Indemnity Pald by Severity Grouping

Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distril	oution	Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of	
rear Closed	# 01 Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity	
2009	4	91.3%	8.7%	0.0%	8.7%	9.5%	
2010	8	98.2%	1.8%	0.2%	1.7%	1.9%	
2011	21	81.4%	18.6%	13.2%	5.4%	22.8%	
2012	37	80.6%	19.4%	14.0%	5.5%	24.1%	
2013	18	68.6%	31.4%	23.5%	8.0%	45.8%	
2014	17	65.8%	34.2%	30.6%	3.5%	51.9%	
2015	28	75.1%	24.9%	19.1%	5.8%	33.2%	
2016	13	84.1%	15.9%	12.5%	3.4%	19.0%	
Total Closed	146	77.7%	22.3%	17.3%	5.0%	28.6%	

Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	Distril	oution	Expense Dist	ribution	Expenses as a % of	
Teal Closed	W OI Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity	
2009	1	85.7%	14.3%	0.0%	14.3%	16.7%	
2010	3	86.1%	13.9%	12.6%	1.3%	16.1%	
2011	13	79.9%	20.1%	14.5%	5.6%	25.1%	
2012	13	81.4%	18.6%	3.8%	14.9%	22.9%	
2013	21	84.6%	15.4%	8.9%	6.5%	18.2%	
2014	10	85.9%	14.1%	11.7%	2.4%	16.4%	
2015	16	78.4%	21.6%	17.8%	3.8%	27.5%	
2016	7	79.9%	20.1%	17.7%	2.3%	25.1%	
Total Closed	84	81.6%	18.4%	10.9%	7.5%	22.6%	

Year Closed	# of Closed Claims	DistrII	oution	Expense Dist	ribution	Expenses as a % o
Teal Gloseu		Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity
2009	0	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
2010	3	91.1%	8.9%	5.4%	3.5%	9.8%
2011	6	88.7%	11.3%	7.6%	3.7%	12.7%
2012	12	84.8%	15.2%	10.6%	4.6%	18.0%
2013	34	90.8%	9.2%	6.5%	2.8%	10.2%
2014	26	91.7%	8.3%	6.0%	2.3%	9.0%
2015	21	88.6%	11.4%	9.7%	1.8%	12.9%
2016	. 9	93.6%	6.4%	4.3%	2.1%	6.9%
Total Closed	111	90.3%	9.7%	7.1%	2.6%	10.7%

		<b>Closed Claims wit</b>	h Indemnity Paym	ents - Severity 09			
Year Closed # of Clos	# of Closed Claims	Distri	butlon	Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of	
	# Of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity	
2009	0	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	
2010	2	96.4%	3.6%	2.7%	0.9%	3.7%	
2011	20	85.7%	14.3%	10.8%	3.4%	16.7%	
2012	19	91.4%	8.6%	6.0%	2.5%	9.4%	
2013	25	84.5%	15.5%	12.9%	2.6%	18.3%	
2014	11	91.2%	8.8%	7.7%	1.1%	9.6%	
2015	20	86.7%	13.3%	10.1%	3.3%	15.4%	
2016	3	81.2%	18.8%	13.9%	4.9%	23.2%	
Total Closed	100	88.0%	12.0%	9.4%	2.6%	13.7%	

Indemnity Distribution=(Avg Indemnity Paid)(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expense Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Defense Counsel Distribution Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense)(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

ALAE Distribution=(Avg ALAE)(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expenses as a % of Indemnity=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)(Avg Indemnity Paid)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009-6/30/2016

#### Exhibit 2-G Closed Claim Summary Closed Claims by Severity Grouping Summary

Indemnity Payments (Exhibit 2-B)								
		All Closed Claims	-	Claims with Indemnity Paid				
Severity of Injury	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity	# of Closed Claims	Total Indemnity	Average Indemnity		
Severity 01-03	527	\$8,114,255	\$15,397	146	\$8,114,255	\$55,577		
Severity 04-05	295	\$20,479,924	\$69,423	84	\$20,479,924	\$243,809		
Severity 06-08	264	\$81,456,706	\$308,548	111	\$81,456,706	\$733,844		
Severity 09	266	\$46,098,279	\$173.302	100	\$46.098.279	\$460.983		

	Defense Costs (Exhibit-2-C)								
	All Close	d Claims	Claims with Ir	demnity Paid	Claims with No	Claims with No Indemnity Pald			
Severity of Injury	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense	# of Closed Claims	Average Defense	# of Classed Claims	Average Defense			
	# of Closed Claims	Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Counsel Expense	# of Closed Claims	Counsel Expense			
Severity 01-03	527	\$8,383	146	\$12,371	381	\$6,855			
Severity 04-05	295	\$19,230	84	\$32,602	211	\$13,906			
Severity 06-08	264	\$41,882	111	\$57,733	153	\$30,383			
Seventy 09	266	\$31,996	100	\$49.329	166	\$21,553			

	PATE TO THE PATE TO		ALAE (Exhibit 2-D)	TO SWILL - MINUTE A		gation Regulation
	All Closed Claims		Claims with Indemnity Paid		Claims with No Indemnity Pald	
Severity of Injury	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE	# of Closed Claims	Average ALAE
Severity 01-03	527	\$2,510	146	\$3,541	381	\$2,114
Severity 04-05	295	\$10,699	84	\$22,410	211	\$6,036
Severity 06-08	264	\$15,485	111	\$20,726	153	\$11,683
Severity 09	266	\$10,646	100	\$13,788	166	\$8,753

	All Closed Claims Expense Ratios (Exhibit 2-E)							
Severity of Injury	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of		
Severity of trijury	# Of Closed Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity		
Severity 01-03	527	58.6%	41.4%	31.9%	9.5%	70.7%		
Severity 04-05	295	69.9%	30.1%	19.4%	10.8%	43.1%		
Severity 06-08	264	84.3%	15.7%	11.4%	4.2%	18.6%		
Severity 09	266	80.3%	19.7%	14.8%	4.9%	24.6%		

	Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid Expense Ratios (Exhibit 2-F)							
Severity of Injury	# of Closed Claims	Distribution		Expense Distribution		Expenses as a % of		
Severity or injury	# Of Clused Claims	Indemnity	Expense	Defense Counsel	ALAE	Indemnity		
Severity 01-03	146	77.7%	22.3%	17.3%	5.0%	28.6%		
Severity 04-05	84	81.6%	18.4%	10.9%	7.5%	22.6%		
Severity 06-08	111	90.3%	9.7%	7.1%	2.6%	10.7%		
Severity 09	100	88.0%	12.0%	9.4%	2.6%	13.7%		

Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)
Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Indemnity Distribution=(Avg Indemnity Paid)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expense Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Defense Counsel Distribution Distribution=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense)(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

ALAE Distribution=(Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid +Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)

Expenses as a % of Indemnity=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Indemnity Paid)

#### Exhibit 3-A Closed Claim Summary Time Horizon: Injury Date to Date Reported

Count	Dietribution	Cumulative		
	Distribution	Count	Distribution	
446	32.6%	446	32.6%	
190	13.9%	636	46.4%	
112	8.2%	748	54.6%	
104	7.6%	852	62.2%	
211	15.4%	1063	77.6%	
213	15.5%	1276	93.1%	
30	2.2%	1306	95.3%	
37	2.7%	1343	98.0%	
27	2.0%	1370	100.0%	
1370	100.0%	1370	100.0%	
	446 190 112 104 211 213 30 37 27 1370	446 32.6% 190 13.9% 112 8.2% 104 7.6% 211 15.4% 213 15.5% 30 2.2% 37 2.7% 27 2.0% 1370 100.0%	Count         Distribution         Count           446         32.6%         446           190         13.9%         636           112         8.2%         748           104         7.6%         852           211         15.4%         1063           213         15.5%         1276           30         2.2%         1306           37         2.7%         1343           27         2.0%         1370	

Injury Date to Date	Count of All Closed				nulative	Percent of Closed
Reported	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Distribution	Claims with Indemnity Paid
0-6 Months	446	160	36.0%	160	36.0%	35.9%
6-12 Months	190	80	18.0%	240	54.1%	42.1%
12-18 Months	112	30	6.8%	270	60.8%	26.8%
18-24 Months	104	37	8.3%	307	69.1%	35.6%
24-36 Months	211	61	13.7%	368	82.9%	28.9%
36-48 Months	213	49	11.0%	417	93.9%	23.0%
48-60 Months	30	7	1.6%	424	95.5%	23.3%
60-90 Months	37	12	2.7%	436	98.2%	32.4%
90+ Months	27	8	1.8%	444	100.0%	29.6%
Total Closed	1370	444	100.0%	444	100.0%	32.4%

		Croseu Cialitis	s With Defense Counse		20 00 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10	
Injury Date to Date	Count of All Closed			Çun	nulative	Percent of Closed
Reported	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Distribution	Claims with Def Counsel Exp
0-6 Months	446	221	24.6%	221	24.6%	49.6%
6-12 Months	190	113	12.6%	334	37.2%	59.5%
12-18 Months	112	75	8.4%	409	45.5%	67.0%
18-24 Months	104	80	8.9%	489	54.5%	76.9%
24-36 Months	211	166	18.5%	655	72.9%	78.7%
36-48 Months	213	178	19.8%	833	92.8%	83.6%
48-60 Months	30	19	2.1%	852	94.9%	63.3%
60-90 Months	37	26	2.9%	878	97.8%	70.3%
90+ Months	27	20	2.2%	898	100.0%	74.1%
Total Closed	1370	898	100.0%	898	100.0%	65.5%

Distribution=(Count of Claims Per Period)/(Total Count of Claims)

Cumulative Count=Accumulation

Cumulative Distribution=Accumulation of Distribution Per Period

Percent of Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid=(Count of Claims with Indemnity Paid Per Period)/(Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Percent of Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expenses=(Count of Claims with Defense Counsel Expense Per Period)(Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

Exhibit 3-B
Closed Claim Summary
Time Horizon: Date Reported to Date of Closure

Date Reported to	Count	Distribution	Cumulative		
Date of Closure		Distribution	Count	Distribution	
0-6 Months	189	13.8%	189	13.8%	
6-12 Months	250	18.2%	439	32.0%	
12-18 Months	258	18.8%	697	50.9%	
18-24 Months	191	13.9%	888	64.8%	
24-36 Months	264	19.3%	1152	84.1%	
36-48 Months	154	11.2%	1306	95.3%	
48-60 Months	47	3.4%	1353	98.8%	
60-90 Months	16	1.2%	1369	99.9%	
90+ Months	1	0.1%	1370	100.0%	
Total Closed	1370	100.0%	1370	100.0%	

		Groseu	Claims With Indemnity		and the second point of the second	
Date Reported to Date	Count of All Closed	_		Cumulative		Percent of Closed
of Closure	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Count Distribution	Claims with Indemnity Paid
0-6 Months	189	53	11.9%	53	11.9%	28.0%
6-12 Months	250	52	11.7%	105	23.6%	20.8%
12-18 Months	258	74	16.7%	179	40.3%	28.7%
18-24 Months	191	52	11.7%	231	52.0%	27.2%
24-36 Months	264	122	27.5%	353	79.5%	46.2%
36-48 Months	154	61	13.7%	414	93.2%	39.6%
48-60 Months	47	22	5.0%	436	98.2%	46.8%
60-90 Months	16	7	1.6%	443	99.8%	43.8%
90+ Months	<u>  1                                   </u>	1	0.2%	444	100.0%	100.0%
Total Closed	1370	444	100.0%	444	100.0%	32.4%

		Closed Claims	With Defense Counsel	Expenses		
Date Reported to Date Cor	unt of All Closed				nulative	Percent of Closed
of Closure	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Distribution	Claims with Def Counsel Exp
0-6 Months	189	57	6.3%	57	6.3%	30.2%
6-12 Months	250	132	14.7%	189	21.0%	52.8%
12-18 Months	258	174	19.4%	363	40.4%	67.4%
18-24 Months	191	141	15.7%	504	56.1%	73.8%
24-36 Months	264	223	24.8%	727	81.0%	84.5%
36-48 Months	154	123	13.7%	850	94.7%	79.9%
48-60 Months	47	31	3.5%	881	98.1%	66.0%
60-90 Months	16	16	1.8%	897	99.9%	100.0%
90+ Months	1	1	0.1%	898	100.0%	100 0%
Total Closed	1370	898	100.0%	898	100.0%	65.5%
		Average Tim	e from Report to Close	: 2 years	THE STATE OF THE S	

Distribution=(Count of Claims Per Period)/(Total Count of Claims)

Cumulative Count=Accumulation

Cumulative Distribution=Accumulation of Distribution Per Period

Percent of Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid=(Count of Claims with Indemnity Paid Per Period)/(Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Percent of Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expenses (Count of Claims with Defense Counsel Expense Per Period) (Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Exhibit 3-C Closed Claim Summary Time Horizon: Injury Date to Date of Closure

		All Closed Claims		- XI (Fig. 1) - III
Injury Date to Date	Count	Distribution	Сип	nulative
of Closure		0.54.544511	Count	Distribution
0-12 Months	152	11.1%	152	11.1%
12-24 Months	236	17.2%	388	28.3%
24-36 Months	234	17.1%	622	45.4%
36-48 Months	270	19.7%	892	65.1%
48-60 Months	199	14.5%	1091	79.6%
60-90 Months	224	16.4%	1315	96.0%
90-120 Months	30	2.2%	1345	98.2%
120+ Months	25	1.8%	1370	100.0%
Total Closed	1370	100.0%	1370	100.0%
a a t-	Average T	ime from injury to Close	e: 3.5 years	

Injury Date to Date of	Count of All Closed	ount of All Closed		Сип	nulative	Percent of Closed
Closure	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Distribution	Claims with Indemnity Paid
0-12 Months	152	55	12.4%	55	12.4%	36.2%
12-24 Months	236	61	13.7%	116	26.1%	25.8%
24-36 Months	234	86	19.4%	202	45.5%	36.8%
36-48 Months	270	85	19.1%	287	64.6%	31.5%
48-60 Months	199	58	13.1%	345	77.7%	29.1%
60-90 Months	224	78	17.6%	423	95.3%	34.8%
90-120 Months	30	13	2.9%	436	98.2%	43.3%
120+ Months	25	8	1.8%	444	100.0%	32.0%
Total Closed	1370	444	100.0%	444	100.0%	32.4%

CONTRACTOR	The same of the sa	Closed Claims	With Defense Counse	l Expenses		
Injury Date to Date of	Count of All Closed			Cun	nulative	Percent of Closed
Closure	Claims	Count	Distribution	Count	Distribution	Claims with Def Counsel Exp
0-12 Months	152	31	3.5%	31	3.5%	20.4%
12-24 Months	236	119	13.3%	150	16.7%	50.4%
24-36 Months	234	155	17.3%	305	34.0%	66.2%
36-48 Months	270	191	21.3%	496	55.2%	70.7%
48-60 Months	199	171	19.0%	667	74.3%	85.9%
60-90 Months	224	190	21.2%	857	95.4%	84.8%
90-120 Months	30	22	2.4%	879	97.9%	73.3%
120+ Months	25	19	2.1%	898	100.0%	76.0%
Total Closed	1370	898	100.0%	898	100.0%	65.5%
		Average Til	ne from injury to Close	: 4 years		

Distribution=(Count of Claims Per Period)/(Total Count of Claims)

Cumulative Count=Accumulation

Cumulative Distribution \*Accumulation of Distribution Per Period

Percent of Closed Claims with Indemnity Paid=(Count of Claims with Indemnity Paid Per Period)/(Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Percent of Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expenses=(Count of Claims with Defense Counsel Expense Per Period)(Count of All Closed Claims Per Period)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

Exhibit 3-D Closed Claim Summary
Injury Date to Date Reported (Indemnity Paid and Expenses)

All Closed Claims								
Injury Date to Date Reported	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-6 Months	309	\$143,271	\$20,113	\$7,775	16.3%			
6-12 Months	134	\$248,415	\$31,208	\$11,554	14.7%			
12-18 Months	98	\$149,711	\$23,318	\$11,521	18.9%			
18-24 Months	70	\$160,948	\$35,001	\$11,955	22.6%			
24-36 Months	142	\$139,999	\$48,369	\$12,512	30.3%			
36-48 Months	151	\$149,242	\$38,241	\$18,237	27.5%			
48-60 Months	42	\$41,667	\$8,917	\$7,933	28.8%			
60-90 Months	24	\$279,658	\$36,321	\$14,991	15.5%			
90+ Months	24	\$75,104	\$27,498	\$10,863	33.8%			
Total Closed	994	\$157,119	\$29,860	\$11,470	20.8%			

Closed Claims With Indemnity Payments								
Injury Date to Date Reported	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-6 Months	160	\$276,691	\$22,558	\$6,615	9.5%			
6-12 Months	80	\$416,095	\$37,563	\$12,696	10.8%			
12-18 Months	30	\$489,054	\$45,284	\$19,472	11.7%			
18-24 Months	37	\$304,496	\$31,783	\$8,235	11.6%			
24-36 Months	61	\$325,899	\$46,207	\$11,415	15.0%			
36-48 Months	49	\$459,909	\$59,788	\$40,246	17.9%			
48-60 Months	7	\$250,000	\$33,247	\$9,349	14.6%			
60-90 Months	12	\$559,317	\$39,346	\$19.809	9.6%			
90+ Months	8	\$225,313	\$35,510	\$18,053	19.2%			
Total Closed	444	\$351,747	\$35,779	\$13,691	12.3%			

Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expense							
Injury Date to Date Reported	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight		
0-6 Months	221	\$192,009	\$28,122	\$9,248	16.3%		
6-12 Months	113	\$285,817	\$37,008	\$11,556	14.5%		
12-18 Months	75	\$168,942	\$30,469	\$11,852	20.0%		
18-24 Months	80	\$109,267	\$30,626	\$10,015	27.1%		
24-36 Months	166	\$117,673	\$41,376	\$10,133	30.4%		
36-48 Months	178	\$126,573	\$32,441	\$15,119	27.3%		
48-60 Months	19	\$90,079	\$19,712	\$8,557	23.9%		
60-90 Months	26	\$210,000	\$33,527	\$8,189	16.6%		
90+ Months	20	\$60,125	\$32,998	\$13,000	43.3%		
Total Closed	898	\$163,230	\$33,052	\$11,190	21.3%		

Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)
Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Expense Weight=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE+Avg Indemnity)

Exhibit 3-E Closed Claim Summary

Date Reported to Date of Closure (Indemnity Paid and Expenses)

All Closed Claims								
Date Reported to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-6 Months	189	\$6,190	\$2,043	\$392	28.2%			
6-12 Months	250	\$17,841	\$4,002	\$1,060	22.1%			
12-18 Months	258	\$74,218	\$13,933	\$4,134	19.6%			
18-24 Months	191	\$140,600	\$24,157	\$5,823	17.6%			
24-36 Months	264	\$228,272	\$40,467	\$19,079	20.7%			
36-48 Months	154	\$180,570	\$38,736	\$19,457	24.4%			
48-60 Months	47	\$165,879	\$47,400	\$12,706	26.6%			
60-90 Months	16	\$454,688	\$60,068	\$11,989	13.7%			
90+ Months	1	\$1,400.000	\$247,949	\$60.887	18.1%			
Total Closed	1370	\$113,997	\$21,665	\$8,322	20.8%			

Closed Claims With Indemnity Payments								
Date Reported to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-6 Months	53	\$22,073	\$4,517	\$698	19.1%			
6-12 Months	52	\$85,774	\$6,719	\$1,328	8.6%			
12-18 Months	74	\$258,758	\$24,175	\$6,056	10.5%			
18-24 Months	52	\$516,436	\$39,977	\$10,295	8.9%			
24-36 Months	122	\$493,967	\$51,836	\$27,551	13.8%			
36-48 Months	61	\$455,865	\$47,363	\$20,790	13.0%			
48-60 Months	22	\$354,379	\$59,148	\$9,585	16.2%			
60-90 Months	7	\$1,039,286	\$95,301	\$12,608	9.4%			
90+ Months	1	\$1,400,000	\$247,949	\$60,887	18.1%			
Total Closed	444	\$351,747	\$35,779	\$13,691	12.3%			

Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expense								
Date Reported to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Welght			
0-6 Months	57	\$12,642	\$6,773	\$816	37.5%			
6-12 Months	132	\$30,634	\$7,579	\$1,537	22.9%			
12-18 Months	174	\$105,108	\$20,660	\$5,449	19.9%			
18-24 Months	141	\$179,508	\$32,723	\$6,641	18.0%			
24-36 Months	223	\$263,930	\$47,908	\$22,213	21.0%			
36-48 Months	123	\$221,506	\$48,499	\$18,279	23.2%			
48-60 Months	31	\$110,984	\$71,864	\$14,837	43.9%			
60-90 Months	16	\$454,688	\$60,068	\$11,989	13.7%			
90+ Months	1	\$1,400,000	\$247,949	\$60,887	18.1%			
Total Closed	898	\$163,230	\$33,052	\$11,190	21.3%			

Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)
Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Expense Weight=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE+Avg Indemnity)

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009-6/30/2016

Exhibit 3-F Closed Claim Summary
Injury Date to Date of Closure (Indemnity Pald and Expenses)

All Closed Claims								
Injury Date to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-12 Months	152	\$5,016	\$1,365	\$480	26.9%			
12-24 Months	236	\$52,359	\$5,804	\$1,728	12.6%			
24-36 Months	234	\$127,565	\$18,073	\$6,809	16.3%			
36-48 Months	270	\$151,134	\$22,053	\$8,497	16.8%			
48-60 Months	199	\$97,401	\$29,237	\$9,289	28.3%			
60-90 Months	224	\$195,212	\$45,700	\$20,003	25.2%			
90-120 Months	30	\$249,577	\$40,552	\$14,735	18.1%			
120+ Months	25	\$72,100	\$25.949	\$10,447	33.5%			
Total Closed	1370	\$113,997	\$21,665	\$8,322	20.8%			

Closed Claims With Indemnity Payments								
Injury Date to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-12 Months	55	\$13,863	\$1,758	\$621	14.6%			
12-24 Months	61	\$202,571	\$11,425	\$2,891	6.6%			
24-36 Months	86	\$347,097	\$32,668	\$9.827	10.9%			
36-48 Months	85	\$480,073	\$39,148	\$16,075	10.3%			
48-60 Months	58	\$334,187	\$45,796	\$13,691	15.1%			
60-90 Months	78	\$560,608	\$64,671	\$32,310	14.7%			
90-120 Months	13	\$575,946	\$74,672	\$15,253	13.5%			
120+ Months	8	\$225,313	\$35,510	\$18,053	19.2%			
Total Closed	444	\$351,747	\$35,779	\$13,691	12.3%			

Closed Claims with Defense Counsel Expense								
Injury Date to Date of Closure	Count	Average Indemnity Paid	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE	Expense Weight			
0-12 Months	31	\$12,685	\$6,691	\$1,071	38.0%			
12-24 Months	119	\$96,125	\$11,510	\$2,731	12.9%			
24-36 Months	155	\$189,451	\$27,285	\$9,695	16.3%			
36-48 Months	191	\$205,392	\$31,175	\$11,574	17.2%			
48-60 Months ,	171	\$111,717	\$34,024	\$8.598	27.6%			
60-90 Months	190	\$203,223	\$53,878	\$21,147	27.0%			
90-120 Months	22	\$328,886	\$55,299	\$10.369	16.6%			
120+ Months	19	\$63,289	\$34,143	\$13,710	43.1%			
Total Closed	898	\$163.230	\$33,052	\$11,190	21.3%			

Average Indemnity = (Total Indemnity Paid)/(Number of Claims)
Average Defense Counsel Expense = (Total Defense Counsel Expense)/(Number of Claims)

Average ALAE = (Total ALAE)/(Number of Claims)

Expense Weight=(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE)/(Avg Defense Counsel Expense+Avg ALAE+Avg Indemnity)

Exhibit 4-A
Screening Panel Usage and Costs

All Closed Claims					
Year Reported	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initlated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims	
2009	79	126	59	264	
2010	84	119	46	249	
2011	101	134	40	275	
2012	94	96	15	205	
2013	78	84	22	184	
2014	69	41	6	116	
2015	52	13	5	70	
2016	5	2	0	7	
Total Reported	562	615	193	1370	
	41%	45%	14%	*	

Year Closed	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
2009	15	8	4	27
2010	60	32	16	108
2011	69	75	31	175
2012	111	116	34	261
2013	81	129	42	252
2014	56	109	24	189
2015	77	110	22	209
2016	93	36	20	149
Total Reported	562	615	193	1370
	41%	45%	14%	

All Closed Claims with suits filed					
	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims	
Went to Trial	0	38	10	48	
Settled prior to Trial	562	577	183	1322	
Total Claims	562	615	193	1370	
% of Claims settled prior to trial	100.0%	93.8%	94.8%	96.5%	
% of Claims Tried	0.0%	6.2%	5.2%	3.5%	

Claims with suits filed that resulted in Indemnity Payments						
Suit / Screening Panel No Suit Screening Panel Not Initiated						
Went to Trial	0	4	0	4		
Settled prior to Trial	161	213	66	440		
Total Claims	161	217	66	444		
% of Claims settled prior to trial	100.0%	98.2%	100.0%	99.1%		
% of Claims Tried	0.0%	1.8%	0.0%	0.9%		

_	All Clos	sed Claims		
*	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
Average Indemnity	29,265	178,423	155,435	113,997
Defense Counsel Expense	3,931	33,057	37,003	21,665
Other Expense	2,390	11,971	13,967	8,322
Total Claim Cost	35,585	223,452	206,405	143,984
Defense as a % of total Claim Cost	21.6%	25.2%	32.8%	26.3%

### Exhibit 4-B Screening Panel Time from Claim Report to Closure

All Closed Claims					
Time from Claim Report to Closure	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims	
0-6 Months	138	45	6	189	
6-12 months	159	70	21	250	
12-18 Months	115	115	28	258	
18-24 Months	60	105	26	191	
24-36 Months	45	157	62	264	
36-48 Months	30	83	41	154	
48-60 Months	15	27	5	47	
60-90 Months	0	12	4	16	
90+ Months	0	0	0	0	
Total Reported	562	614	193	1369	
% Closed <1yr	52.8%	18.7%	14.0%	32.1%	
% Closed <2yr	84.0%	54.6%	42.0%	64.9%	
% Closed <3yr	92.0%	80.1%	74.1%	84.1%	
% Closed <5yr	100.0%	98.0%	97.9%	98.8%	
erage Months from Claim Report to C	14	24	27	21	

Time from Claim Report to Closure	No Suit	Sult / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
0-6 Months	49	3	1	53
6-12 months	41	7	4	52
12-18 Months	24	44	6	74
18-24 Months	14	31	7	52
24-36 Months	21	74	27	122
36-48 Months	6	36	19	61
48-60 Months	6	14	2	22
60-90 Months	0	7	0	7
90+ Months	0	0	0	0
Total Reported	161	216	66	443
% Closed <1 yr	55.9%	4.6%	7.6%	23.7%
% Closed <2yr	79.5%	39.4%	27.3%	52.1%
% Closed <3yr	92.5%	73.6%	68.2%	79.7%
% Closed <5yr	100.0%	96.8%	100.0%	98.4%
erage Months from Claim Report to C	15	29	29	24

#### Exhibit 4-C Screening Panel Usage by Claim Severity

	Claims with	Indemnity Payments		
Severity	No Suit	Sult / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
01	67	28	6	101
02	51	19	6	76
03	218	102	30	350
-04	74	74	17	165
05	49	68	13	130
06	23	81	31	135
07	8	72	19	99
08	11	11	8	30
09	51	152	63	266
Grand Total	552	607	193	1352
Emotional or Temp Minor	60.9%	24.5%	21.8%	39.0%
Temp Major, Perm Minor	22.3%	23.4%	15.5%	21.8%
Permanent and Serious	7.6%	27.0%	30.1%	19.5%
Fatal	9.2%	25.0%	32.6%	19.7%

Exhibit 4-D Screening Panel Usage and Costs Permanent / Serious and Fatal Claims

All Closed Claims						
	No Sult	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims		
Went to Trial	0	11	7	18		
Settled prior to Trial	93	305	114	512		
Total Claims	93	316	121	530		
% of Claims settled prior to trial	100.0%	96.5%	94.2%	96.6%		
% of Claims Tried	0.0%	3.5%	5.8%	3.4%		

	Claims with In-	demnity Payments		
·	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
Average Indemnity	97,640	288,867	224,731	240,670
Defense Counsel Expense	9,487	43,462	40,922	36,920
Other Expense	6,147	13,730	16,607	13.056
Total Claim Cost	113,274	346,059	282,260	290,646
Defense as a % of total Claim Cost	16.0%	19.8%	25.6%	20.8%

All Closed Claims					
Time from Claim Report to Closure	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims	
0-6 Months	5	8	2	15	
6-12 months	24	16	10	50	
12-18 Months	27	60	19	106	
18-24 Months	15	52	15	82	
24-36 Months	6	92	42	140	
36-48 Months	9	59	26	94	
48-60 Months	7	21	3	31	
60-90 Months	0	8	4	12	
90+ Months	0	0	0	0	
Total Reported	93	316	121	530	
% Closed <1yr	31.2%	7.6%	9.9%	12.3%	
% Closed <2yr	76.3%	43.0%	38.0%	47.7%	
% Closed <3yr	82.8%	72.2%	72.7%	74.2%	
% Closed <5yr	100.0%	97.5%	96.7%	97.7%	
erage Months from Claim Report to C	20	28	28	27	

Exhibit 4-E Screening Panel Usage and Costs Temporary and Minor Claims

All Closed Claims						
	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims		
Went to Trial	0	27	3	30		
Settled prior to Trial	459	264	69	792		
Total Claims	459	291	72	822		
% of Claims settled prior to trial	100.0%	90.7%	95.8%	96.4%		
% of Claims Tried	0.0%	9.3%	4.2%	3.6%		

	Claims with In-	demnity Payments		
	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
Average Indemnity	15,990	63,396	38,978	34,786
Defense Counsel Expense	2,868	22,627	30,418	12,276
Other Expense	1,675	10,390	9,532	5,449
Total Claim Cost	20,533	96,413	78,927	52,511
Defense as a % of total Claim Cost	28.4%	52.1%	102.5%	51.0%

	All C	losed Claims	·	
Time from Claim Report to Closure	No Suit	Suit / Screening Panel Not Initiated	Screening Panel Initiated	Total Claims
0-6 Months	126	35	4	165
6-12 months	135	50	11	196
12-18 Months	86	53	9	148
18-24 Months	44	53	11	108
24-36 Months	39	65	20	124
36-48 Months	21	24	15	60
48-60 Months	8	6	2	16
60-90 Months	0	4	0	4
90+ Months	0	0	0	0
Total Reported	459	290	72	821
% Closed <1yr	56.9%	29.3%	20.8%	44.0%
% Closed <2yr	85.2%	65.9%	48.6%	75.2%
% Closed <3yr	93.7%	88.3%	76.4%	90.3%
% Closed <5yr	100.0%	98.6%	100.0%	99.5%
erage Months from Claim Report to C	13	21	25	17

Medical Malpractice Data Received Under INS 3800 1/1/2009- 6/30/2016

## Exhibit 5 Closed Claim Summary Closed Claims by Location of Injury

	All Ck	sed Claims: Aggreg	ate		
Location of Injury	Number of Closed Claims	Percent Closed by Location	Average Indemnity	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE
Hospital Inpatient Facility	557	40.7%	\$141,092	\$26,750	\$9,361
Physician's Office	233	17.0%	\$115,630	\$18,124	\$5,939
Emergency Room	202	14.7%	\$111,445	\$22,999	\$14,169
Hospital Outpatient Facility	128	9.3%	\$31,103	\$11,552	\$6,385
Other Outpatient Facility (Including clinics)	54	3.9%	\$90,758	\$16,590	\$2,544
Nursing Home	27	2.0%	\$86,399	\$32,554	\$6,618
Patient's Home	9	0.7%	\$262,111	\$42,647	\$2,251
Other	160	11.7%	\$91,000	\$14,219	\$4,919
Grand Total	1370	100.0%	\$113,997	\$21,665	\$8,322

Percent Closed by Location=(Number Closed by Location)/(All Closed Claims)

#### Exhibit 6 Closed Claim Summary Closed Claims by Profession

SELECTION OF THE PROPERTY OF T	All Ck	sed Claims: Aggreg	ate		
· Profession	Number of Closed Claims	Percent Closed by Profession	Average Indemnity	Average Defense Counsel Expense	Average ALAE
Physician/Surgeon	527	38.5%	\$134,196	\$26,568	\$12,750
Hospital	435	31.8%	\$131,549	\$21,035	\$6,668
Clinic/Corporation/Other	248	18.1%	\$66,760	\$20,443	\$5,606
Dentist	74	5.4%	\$18,976	\$3,345	\$1,994
Nurse	48	3.5%	\$192,317	\$18,077	\$4,110
Nursing Home	13	0.9%	\$33,161	\$14,299	\$647
Other	10	0.7%	\$300	\$1,807	\$1,122
Podiatrist/Chiropodist	7	0.5%	\$19,286	\$11,492	\$1,797
Chiropractor	5	0.4%	\$800	\$2,721	\$200
Pharmacy	2	0.1%	\$231,000	\$23,197	\$6,309
Optometrist	1	0.1%	\$3,457	\$0	\$0
Grand Total	1370	100.0%	\$113.997	\$21,665	\$8,322

Percent Closed by Profession=(Number Closed by Profession)/(All Closed Claims)

#### Exhibit 7 Closed Claim Summary Claims by Company

All Closed C	laims: Aggregate	at all the same of the last
Insurer/Provider	Number of Closed Claims	Percent of Closed Claims by Company
ProSelect	265	19.3%
Dartmouth Hitchcock	203	14.8%
AUL	179	13.1%
Granite Shield	139	10.1%
Medical Mutual of Maine	138	10.1%
CNA	87	6.4%
HCI	76	5.5%
Exeter Health	51	3.7%
AIG	43	3.1%
Medical Protective	38	2.8%
Markel	22	1.6%
Covenant Health	19	1.4%
Darwin / Allied World	16	1.2%
Concord Hospital	14	1.0%
OMSNIC	13	0.9%
Elliot Hospital	13	0.9%
National Fire & Marine	11	0.8%
Preferred Professionals	10	0.7%
Cincinnati Insurance Group	8	0.6%
The Doctor's Company	6	0.4%
NOMIC	4	0.3%
Endurance	2 2	0.1%
Colony Insurance Company	2	0.1%
Other		0.8%
Grand Total	1370	100.0%

Percent of Claims by Company=(Number Closed by Company)/(All Closed Claims)
Percent of Closed by Company=(Number Closed by Company)/(All Closed Claims)

## PHYSICIANS AND SURGEONS MEDICAL MALPRACTICE INSURANCE RATE COMPARISON CURRENT MARKET LEADERS IN NEW HAMPSHIRE

	ISO		Occ:	Оссипелсе Ргетінт		0	laims Made -	-	Cla	Claims Made - Mature	ure
Specialty	Class	12	Med Pro	MMICof ME	ProSelect	Med Pro	MMICof ME	ProSelect	Med Pro	MMICof ME	ProSelect
Family Practice - NS	80420		13,876	n/a	12,573	4,173	3,773	3,637	13,042	13,973	12,124
Radiology	80280		20,235	n/a	22,004	6,087	7,047	6,365	19,021	26,199	21,218
Cardiology - NS	80255		17,345	n/a	12,573	5,216	4,056	3,637	16,304	15,021	12,124
General Surgery	80143	Ş	52,325	n/a	49,998	15,741	14,525	14,463	49,188	53,796	48,212
Neurosurgery	80152		92,340	n/a	119,111	27,777	27,352	34,456	86,802	101,304	114,857
OB / GYN	80153		61,560	n/a	80,878	18,517	18,675	23,397	57,868	69,166	77,990

# POTENTIAL ADJUSTMENTS TO REFLECT PRIOR CLAIMS ACTIVITY

	10+ 20%	9 10%	8 10%	7 10%	6 10%	5 10%	5%	3 5%	Years Credit		<ul> <li>non-meritorious or frivolous claims</li> </ul>	- improper inclusion	<ul> <li>blanket defendant listings</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>mistaken identity</li> </ul>	instances of:	<ul> <li>Claims for this purpose does not include</li> </ul>		- Premium credit for time without a claim	Med Pro
- maximum of 15%	<ul> <li>1% discount for each consecutive year a physician is insured with MMIC and loss free</li> </ul>	loss = indemnity payment of \$15 K or more	- Loss Free Discount		<ul> <li>surcharge ranges from 10 to 50%</li> </ul>	not reflective of established norms	<ul> <li>physician displays characteristics or patterns of practice</li> </ul>	- Other	surcharge - amount determined by Underwriting Committee	preceptorship or sponsorship in a hospital subject to	<ul> <li>physicians under punitive or disciplinary observation,</li> </ul>	- Hospital Disciplinary Action	policy years	<ul> <li>subject to a 10% surcharge for each chargeable claim for two</li> </ul>	negligence on the part of the physician is reasonably clear	<ul> <li>in judgement of company underwriting committee</li> </ul>	- Chargeable claims	- Standard Program Premium Surcharges	MMIC of ME
<ul> <li>"claim free" means no paid claims of more than \$10,000</li> <li>1% discount for each year up to 15</li> <li>Experience Ratino Plan available to proups of 3 or more</li> </ul>	- Claim-Free Program - minimum of 3 years claim free		effective risk management (15% credit available)	- past loss history	experience of staff	<ul> <li>adequacy of staffing, selection, supervision and</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>office appraisal</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>qualification and experience of insured</li> </ul>	- for Group, schedule reflects:	<ul> <li>continuing education</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>office surgery inspection by an approved org.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>unusual risk characteristics</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>professional liability loss history - freq. or severity</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>acceptance of risk management provisions</li> </ul>	reflected in the experience for the class:	<ul> <li>based on schedule of specific characteristics not</li> </ul>	- overall credit or debit of - 40% to +25%	<ul> <li>Individual and Group Practice Schedule Rating plan</li> </ul>	ProSelect

U	
8	
ğ	
N	
Ф	
<u>o</u>	

MMICof ME ProSelect Med Pro

9/1/2014

7/1/2011

5.2% 9.2% -6.1% Company

Date

Amount

1st Prior Date

Amount

2nd Prior Date

Amount

COMPANIES

11/1/2011

-2.2%

10/1/2012 9/1/2009

10/1/2010

5.0%

part of the ProMutual Group

Medical Protective Company

Medical Mutual Insurance Company of Maine

8.4% -5.9% RATE ACTIVITY - RECENT YEARS
Most Recent

**NEW HAMPSHIRE INSURANCE DEPARTMENT** 

## MEDICAL MALPRACTICE LIABILITY INSURANCE

## RATE HISTORY BEGINNING 1/1/2009 Physicians and Surgeons

	Medical Mutual Inc Co of ME	Ine Co of ME	Drocalact Inch	Proselect Insurance Company	Medical	Medical Protective
<b>Y</b>		Amt of Cha	Eff Date	Amt of Cha	E# Date	Amt of Cha
2009	1		10/1/2009	4.0%	9/1/2009	-5.9%
2010	10/1/2010	5.0%				
2011	11/1/2011	-2.2%	10/1/2011	6.0%	7/1/2011	-6.1%
2012			10/1/2012	8.4%		
2013			10/1/2013	9.2%		
2014	9/1/2014	5.2%				
2015						
2016						
All Years	Count 3	Avg Annual Change 1.1%	Count 4	Avg Annual Change 3.9%	Count 2	Avg Annual Change -1.8%
2009 to 2011 2012 to current	→ N	0.9% 1.3%	NN	3.3% 4.3%	0 2	-4.0% 0.0%
2009 to 2011		Total Chg over period 2.7%		Fotal Chg over period 10.2%		Total Chg over period -11.6%
<b>Cumulative Rate Change Summary</b>	ary	8.0%		30.5%		-11.6%

Note: MMIC-ME, ProSelect and the Med Pro make up approximately 47% of the total Medical Malpractice market in NH and 67% of the regulated market.

#### **Appendix** General Information & Definitions

<u>Claim Database</u> Of the 1370 closed claim reports -

18 reports omitted Severity Codes

16 reports omitted Act or Omission Codes

8 reports omitted Profession Codes

10 reports omitted Location of Injury Codes

0 report omitted information regarding the Injury Date

0 reports omitted information regarding the Report Date

These figures account for total number of closed claims varying among exhibits.

#### Other Notes Regarding Report

Variations in values from previous reports are due to corrections in the claim database and claims reopened after being reported as closed.

#### **Definitions & Coding**

Indemnity Payment - Amount of dollars paid to the Indemnify claimant on behalf of the healthcare provider

Defense Counsel Expense - Expenses paid or incurred for defense, litigation and cost containment services

ALAE - Allocated Loss Adjustment Expense - Other expenses used to pay for fees and adjusters, attorney fees paid in the determination of coverage, and adju Loss Adjustment Expense (LAE) = Defense Counsel Expense + ALAE Injury Date - Date principal or alleged injury occurred

Date Reported - Date when injury was first reported to insurer

Date of Closure - Date when case is closed due to settlement or trial

Severity Code:	Severity T/P	Severity of Injury	Severity Example
01	Temporary	Emotional Only	Fright, no physical damage
02	Temporary	Insignificant	Lacerations, contusions, minor scars, rash. No delay.
03	Temporary	Minor	Infections, mis-set fracture, fall in hospital. Recovery delayed.
04	Temporary	Major	Burns, surgical material left, drug side effect, brain damage. Recovery delayed.
05	Permanent	Minor	Loss of fingers, loss or damage to organs. Includes nondisabling injuries.
06	Permanent	Significant	Deafness, loss of limb, loss of eye, loss of one kidney or lung.
07	Permanent	Major	Paraplegia, blindness, loss of two limbs, brain damage.
08	Permanent	Grave	Quadriplegia, severe brain damage, lifelong care, or fatal prognosis.
09	Permanent	Death	Death